

**Aasheesh Pittie**

---

**From:** Alan Peterson [alanpp@bmi.net]  
**Sent:** 12 April, 2005 01:52 AM  
**To:** Aasheesh Pittie  
**Subject:** [Fwd: Re: Questions now on a Hodgson citation.]



Re\_ Questions now  
on a Hodgson...

Aaseesh,

Greetings, I hope your trip to England was successful and enjoyable.

I am forwarding a question I directed to Edward at his suggestion. It appears to suggest that the proper citation for *Buceros nipalensis* (now *Aceros nipalensis*) might be *Gleanings in Science*, rather than *Asiatic Researches*. (Details should be clear in the forwarded component of this email.) I think Edward is not very interested as it does not seem to suggest a change in the YEAR of publication, and the details of the proper citation do not appear to be ones that he is troubling himself with at present.

Thanks for any time you may spend looking into this.

Alan

**Aasheesh Pittie**

**From:** Edward Dickinson [asiaorn@tiscali.co.uk]  
**Sent:** 11 April, 2005 12:33 PM  
**To:** Alan Peterson  
**Subject:** Re: Questions now on a Hodgson citation.

Dear Alan,

I have so far only scratched the surface of Hodgson's works. Aasheesh Pittie has a pretty complete set of photocopies of papers on birds from Asiatic Researches and I recommend that you ask him.

yours aye,

Edward

----- Original Message -----

**From:** Alan Peterson  
**To:** Edward Dickinson  
**Sent:** Sunday, April 10, 2005 8:22 PM  
**Subject:** Questions now on a Hodgson citation.

Dear Edward,

Sorry to keep kicking up dust, but I have looked into the question outlined below and have run out of ideas for further investigation.

When I looked at my citations to Asiatic Researches, the earliest ones I have look like this:

1829 As.Res. 18 pt1 p. 178 pl.1,2 *Aceros nipalensis* (Hodgson)  
 1833 As.Res. 18 pt2 p. 013 pl.1 *Aquila nipalensis* Hodgson  
 1836 As.Res. 19 p. 145 *Actinodura nipalensis* (Hodgson)  
 1836 As.Res. 19 p. 147 *Garrulax caerulatus* (Hodgson)  
 1836 As.Res. 19 p. 147 *Garrulax monileger* (Hodgson)

.....  
 .....

Those first two looked a little funny with 4 years separating pts 1 & 2 of vol. 18.

I looked *Buceros nipalensis* up in CWR and Peters, and they show the same citation and a date of 1829. CWR has pencilled note that says "1832 in Sherborn", and sure enough in *Ind. Anim.* p.4290 Sherborn gives the date as 1832, but with the same citation (*Asiat. Res.* XVIII (1) 1832, 178. Where to turn next?

Well I tried my copy of Carus and Englemann (1861) and here's what it has:

**Hodgson, B. H.** On a new species of ***Buceros*** (***B. Nipalensis***). in: *Gleanings in Science* Vol. 1. 1829. p. 249-252. -- *Asiat. Reseach.* Vol. 17. *Phys. Cl.* p.178-186. (Mit 2 Taf.) --*Féruss. Bull. Sc. nat.* Tom. 26. 1831. p.79-81.

You will note they put the *Asiat. Res.* to volume 17 (contra 18 as by the others), and the lack of a date associated with the *Asiat. Res.* component makes me believe that this is held to ALSO be in 1829. *Gleanings in Science* is listed by my copy of Bolton as a monthly periodical "forming the forerunner of the *Journal of the Asiatic Society of Bengal*". An interpretation confirmed by the *Cat.Books Brit. Mus. N.H.*

12-Apr-05

So we have two different dates (1829, 1832) and three different sources (Gleanings in Science, Asiatic Researches 17, or Asiatic Researches 18).

[  
I have (so far) only ONE taxon that I cite to Gleanings in Science, to wit *Gallinago solitaria* Hodgson Glean.Sci. III no.32 (n.s. no.VII) Aug. 1831 p.238;  
(that citation is copied from CWR, and is essentially the same as what Peters II:274 has. [Actually on looking again, I see that CWR has it as "Gleanings of Science" (emphasis added) which seems almost certainly to be a *lapsus* on CWR's part.]

Of interest, Sherborn cites *G. solitaria* to J.A.S.B. VI. 1837, p.491 (CWR also has a card for this 1837 JASB "[Gallinago] Solitaria".)

]

In summary:

- 1.) It does not appear that Sherborn is the authority to trust here.
- 2.) 1829 looks likely to stand up as the correct date for the taxon *Buceros Nipalensis*.
- 3.) The contest is between *Gleanings in Science* and *Asiatic Researches*; if the latter, the question is vol.17 or vol.18.
- 4.) Gleanings in Science appears to be the common citation for *Gallinago solitaria*, so we can presume people have LOOKED at the thing (there is a set at South K.).

Not much of immediate significance for H&M (the 1829 date for *Aceros nipalensis* looks like it should "stand" (*contra* Sherborn).

Anyway, with your focus on Oriental Ornithology I thought you might have some ideas or suggestions for solving this small riddle.

Cheers,

Alan

The Cent. Rev., article (pp. Part I pp. 46-51) does not give dts. of parts of 17-20.

} Vol	1	— 1788	[Cent. Rev. Part I p. 47]
	2	— 1790	( " " Part I p. 47 )
	3	— 1793	"
	4	— 1795	"
	5	— 1797	"

**ACEROS NIPALENSIS**

Dates of publication of Asiatic Researches (Nair 2000)

Proceedings dated 27<sup>th</sup> March 1833, printed in JASB II: 149-154 (1833), and I quote:

“[6] The Asiatic Researches printed on account of the Society as follow.

- The 6<sup>th</sup> vol., was printed in 1799 —
- 7<sup>th</sup> 1801 —
- 8<sup>th</sup> 1805 —
- 9<sup>th</sup> 1807 —
- 10<sup>th</sup> 1808 —
- 11<sup>th</sup> 1810 —
- 12<sup>th</sup> 1816 —
- 13<sup>th</sup> 1820 —
- 14<sup>th</sup> 1822 —
- 15<sup>th</sup> 1825 —
- 16<sup>th</sup> 1828 —
- 17<sup>th</sup> 1833 —
- 1<sup>st</sup> part physical class 1829”

\* Minted that 12 copies of papers to be sent to authors (Cent. Rev. Part I p. 50).

(1832 - Cent. Rev. Part I p. 49)

“The first part of the 18<sup>th</sup> volume was completed in the early part of 1833. The Proceedings did not state the exact date or month in which this part was printed by the Military Orphan Press and copies were transmitted to England for distribution and sale. The Second Part of the 18<sup>th</sup> volume was printed in July 1833 for which the printer’s bill for Rs. 1962 was submitted on 31<sup>st</sup> July... The printing of maps and plates was completed in October 1833 and permission for export of 100 copies to England... was obtained by 30<sup>th</sup> October,” Nair (2000, p. 402).

He goes on to state that the first part of volume 19 was “printed off by the end of 1836” (p. 403). The second part of volume 19 “came out of the Bishop’s College Press early in October 1839... laid before the meeting of 2<sup>nd</sup> October a copy,” (p. 404). Part one of volume 20 was printed in 1836 for which a bill was submitted dated 3-8-1836; part two “was ready in the first week of June 1839 or earlier, for ... apprized the meeting (of 5<sup>th</sup> June 1839) the completion,” (Nair 2000, pp. 404-405).

So to complete the table above:

- 18<sup>th</sup> part 1 1833 } —
- 18<sup>th</sup> part 2 1833 } —
- 19<sup>th</sup> part 1 x. 1836 —
- 19<sup>th</sup> part 2 before 2. x. 1839 ?
- 20<sup>th</sup> part 1 before 3. viii. 1836
- 20<sup>th</sup> part 2 before 5. vi. 1839 —

**REFERENCES**

Nair, P. Thankappan. (Ed.) 2000. Proceedings of the Asiatic Society. Volume IV, 1833-1841. James Prinsep’s Period. Book I. i-xxxii, 1-1461. The Asiatic Society: Calcutta.

Group: C:\PAPREFS\SEARCH.GRP  
Temporary group for searching  
Sorted by: Year, Volume, Issue, Pages  
Using Format: OUTPUT  
Current Search: j="Asiatick Researches"  
Last Search run on 12 Apr 2005, at 15:29  
Last modified on 12 Apr 2005, at 15:35  
Contains 14 references

Listed with Format OUTPUT

Listing Created 12 Apr 2005, at 15:35

**WHITE, Charles.** 1795. On the Dhanesa, or Indian Buceros. *Asiatick Researches* IV : 119-128. <Xerox copy held.>

**HODGSON, B. H.** 1833. On a New Species of *Buceros*. *Asiatick Researches* XVIII (I): 178-186. (With two plates.). <Xerox copy held.>

[The generally accepted year for this paper and the new taxon *Buceros nipalensis* is 1829, however see Nair, P. T. 2000. (*Proceeding of the Asiatic Society. 1833-1841. Volume IV. Book I. Calcutta: The Asiatic Society.*), for accepting 1833 here.]

New-taxon

(23735. Hodgson 1833)  
*Buceros Nipalensis* (= *Aceros nipalensis*).

---. 1833. On a species of *Aquila*, *Circæetus*, and *Dicrurus*. *Asiatick Researches* XVIII (II): 13-26. (2 Plates.). <Xerox copy held.>

[The paper is divided into three sections, individually numbered respective to the taxa enumerated in the title. The third section also describes a *Lanius* sp. on pp. 24-26, but does not name it. The paper is dated "June, 1829," (p. 26), as is the plate entitled "*Aquila nipalensis*", "1829".]

New-taxon

(23737. Hodgson 1833)  
*Aquila nipalensis* (= *Aquila rapax nipalensis*). (= *Aquila nipalensis*).  
*Circæetus nipalensis* (= *Spilornis cheela cheela*).

---. 1833. On the Migration of the Natatores and Gallatores, as observed at Kathmandu. *Asiatick Researches* XVIII (II): 122-128. <Xerox copy held.>  
[The paper is dated, "5th October, 1831" on p. 128.]

---. 1833. Description of the *Buceros Homrai* of the Himalaya; [with "Remarks on the skeleton of the *Homrai Buceros*", by Dr. M.J. Bramley, pp. 180-188.]. *Asiatick Researches* XVIII (II): 169-188. (1 plate.). <Xerox copy held.>  
[The paper is dated at the end as, "February, 1832."]

New-taxon

(23739. Hodgson 1833)

*Buceros hômrâi* (= *Buceros bicornis*).

---. 1836. Description of three new species of *Paradoxurus* (*P. hirsutus*, *P. Nepalensis*, *P. lanigerus*). *Asiatick Researches* XIX (I): 72-86. <Not seen.>

---. 1836. Notices of the ornithology of Nepal. I. Eight new species of *Cinclosoma*, with some remarks on the genus. *Asiatick Researches* XIX (I): 143-150. ("After Sept. 1836," (Baker in F.B.I. vii: 29). Date at end of paper in original (p. 150), "June 1836".). <Xerox copy held.>

#### New-taxon

(23752. Hodgson 1836)

*Cinc. Albigula* (*Garrulax albogularis albogularis*).

*Cinc. grisauris* (*Garrulax pectoralis pectoralis*)

*Cinc. Cærulatus* (= *Garrulax caerulatus caerulatus*).

*Cinc. Melanura* (= *Garrulax squamatus*).

*Cinc. Moniligera* (= *Garrulax moniligerus moniligerus*).

*Cinclosoma? Nipalensis* (= *Actinodura nipalensis nipalensis*).

*Cinc. Rufimenta* (= *Garrulax rufogularis rufogularis*).

*Cinc. Setafer* (= *Garrulax lineatus setafer*).

*Sibia? Nipalensis* (= *Actinodura nipalensis nipalensis*).

---. 1836. Notices of the ornithology of Nepal. II. New species of the Thick billed Finches. *Asiatick Researches* XIX (I): 150-159. ("After Sept. 1836," (Baker in F.B.I. vii.)). <Xerox copy held.>

#### New-genus

(23753. Hodgson 1836)

*Corythus* (= *Haematospiza*), (= *Propyrrhula*).

*Munia* (= *Lonchura*).

#### New-taxon

(23753. Hodgson 1836)

*C. (arduelis) Nipalensis* (= *Carpodacus nipalensis nipalensis*).

*Coc. (cothraustes) Carnipes* (= *Mycerobas carnipes*).

*Coc. (cothraustes) Melanozanthos* (= *Mycerobas melanozanthus*).

*C. (orythus) Sipahi* (= *Haematospiza sipahi*).

*Corythus? Subhimachalus* (= *Propyrrhula subhimachala*).

*F. (ringalanda) Nemoricola* (= *Leucosticte nemoricola nemoricola*). [Hodgson later corrected the generic taxon spelling to "*Fringillauda*".].

*M. (unia) Acuticauda* (= *Lonchura striata acuticauda*).

*M. (unia) Lineoventer* (= *Lonchura punctulata punctulata*).

*M. (unia) Rubroniger* (= *Lonchura malacca rubronigra*).

*P. (yrrhula)? Epauletta* (= *Pyrrhoplectes epauletta*).

*P. (yrrhula) Nipalensis* (= *Pyrrhula nipalensis nipalensis*).

#### Spelling

(23753. Hodgson 1836)

"*Munia rubroniger* Hodgson, 1836, must be spelt *Lonchura malacca rubronigra*, not *L. m. rubroniger*." David & Gosselin 2002 *BOC* 122(1): 18 (q.v.).

---. 1836. Notices of the ornithology of Nepal. III. New genera of the Columbidae. *Asiatick Researches* XIX (I): 159-164. ("After Sept. 1836," (Baker in F.B.I. vii.)). <Xerox copy held.>

New-genus

(23754. Hodgson 1836)

*Ducula* (= *Ducula*).

*Toria* (= *Treron*). ["*Toria* probably means yellow colour like that of Mustard flower. Mustard is known as *Tori* in Nepali and *Toria* probably means the yellow mustard. In the lowland, Tharu name for mustard like plant is *Toria*. Indeed pigeons like Yellow-footed Green Pigeons have this mustard colour!" Hem Sagar Baral in litt. email dated 25.ii.2004.].

New-taxon

(23754. Hodgson 1836)

*Ducula Insignis* (= *Ducula badia insignis*).

*Toria Nipalensis* (= *Treron curvirostra niplaensis*).

---. 1836. Notices of the ornithology of Nepal. IV. New genus and 3 new species of the *Silviadæ*. *Asiatick Researches* XIX (I): 165-167. ("After Sept. 1836," (Baker in F.B.I. vii.)). <Xerox copy held.>

New-taxon

(23755. Hodgson 1836)

*Yuhina? Flavicollis* (= *Yuhina flavicollis flavicollis*).

*Yuhina Gularis* (= *Yuhina gularis gularis*).

*Yuhina Occipitalis* (= *Yuhina occipitalis occipitalis*).

---. 1836. Notices of the ornithology of Nepal. V. New species of the Strigine family. *Asiatick Researches* XIX (I): 168-177. ("After Sept. 1836," (Baker in F.B.I. vii.)). Date on p. 177, "27th August." <Xerox copy held.>

New-taxon

(23756. Hodgson 1836)

*Bubo? Cavearius* (= ).

*Bubo Nipalensis* (= *Bubo nipalensis nipalensis*).

*Noctua Tarayensis* (= *Athene brama*). [From tarai.].

*Noctua tubiger* (= *Glaucidium brodiei brodiei*).

*Scops Lettia* (= *Otus bakkamoena lettia*). ["The *Lattya Cusyal* of Nepal," p. 176.].

*Scops Sunia* (= *Otus scops sunia*). ["*Sunya Cusyal* of Nepal," p. 175.].

*Ulula Newarensis* (= *Strix leptogrammica newarensis*). ["Newar, name of the indigenous people of Nepal proper," p. 168.].

---. 1836. Notices of the ornithology of Nepal. VII (sic) [VI - A.P.]. Two new species of the parrot tribe. *Asiatick Researches* XIX (I): 177-178. (Paper dated "August 29th, 1836" on p. 178.). <Xerox copy held.>

New-taxon

(23757. Hodgson 1836)

*Palæornis Nipalensis* (= *Psittacula eupatria nipalensis*).

*Palæornis Schisticeps* (= *Psittacula himalayana*).

---. 1836. Notices of the ornithology of Nepal. VIII (sic) [VII - A.P.]. New species of *Pomatorhinus*, and its allies, with remarks on the genus. *Asiatick Researches* XIX (I): 179-186. (Paper dated "August 29th" on p. 186.). <Xerox

copy held.>

New-genus

(23758. Hodgson 1836)  
*Suya* (= *Prinia*).

New-taxon

(23758. Hodgson 1836)  
*Pomatorhinus Ferrugilatus* (= *Pomatorhinus erythrogegens erythrogegens*).  
*Pomatorhinus Ruficollis* (= *Pomatorhinus ruficollis ruficollis*).  
*Pomatorhinus Schisticeps* (= *Pomatorhinus schisticeps* (*Horsfieldii*)  
*schisticeps*).  
*Prinia? criniger* (= *Prinia crinigera crinigera*).  
*Suya criniger* (= *Prinia crinigera crinigera*).  
*Timalia Nipalensis* (= *Turdoides nipalensis*).  
*Timalia Pellotis* (= *Turdoides nipalensis*).

Spelling

(23758. Hodgson 1836)  
"Suya criniger Hodgson, 1836, spelt *Prinia crinigera* not *P. criniger*" (p. 19).

Type-Locality

(23758. Hodgson 1836)  
*Pomatorhinus ruficollis* Nepal, restricted to Kathmandu Valley by Ripley, 1961, *Synopsis*, 1st ed.

---. 1836. Notices of the ornithology of Nepal. IX (*sic*) [VIII - A.P.]. New species of Motacillinae. With indication of a new genus belonging to this sub-family. *Asiatick Researches* XIX (I): 186-192. (Paper dated "September 1836" on p. 192.). <Xerox copy held.>

New-genus

(23759. Hodgson 1836)  
*Dahila* (= *Copsychus*).

New-taxon

(23759. Hodgson 1836)  
*Dahila Docilis* (= *Copsychus saularis*).  
(*Motacilla*) *Alboides* (= *Motacilla alba alboides*).  
*Motacilla* (*Budytes*) *Calcarata* (= *Motacilla citreola calcarata*).  
*Motacilla* (*Enicurus*) *Fuliginosus* (= *Enicurus maculatus maculatus*).  
*Motacilla* (*Enicurus*) *Immaculatus* (= *Enicurus immaculatus*).  
*Motacilla* (*Enicurus*) *Schistaceus* (= *Enicurus schistaceus*).

## Aasheesh Pittie

---

**From:** Alan Peterson [alanpp@bmi.net]  
**Sent:** 12 April, 2005 06:57 AM  
**To:** Aasheesh Pittie  
**Subject:** [Fwd: Re: Treron pompadora chloropterus Blyth date? H&M p.172;PetersIII:16 HBW 5:195]



Re\_ Treron  
ompadora chloropter.

Hello Aasheesh,

Sorry to trouble you with another question, but as you will see from the attached, Edward again steered me your way.

Treron pompadora chloropterus Blyth, is usually attributed to JASB from 1846. The Richmond Index indicates that this name and a description was published by "B" (whom I think extremely strong evidence indicates was Blyth) in 1845 in the September number of the Indian Sporting Review.

The details available to me are to be found in the attached string of emails.

Edward says he has little enthusiasm for this investigation, but I would certainly like to establish the correct year and citation for the taxon.

Can you shed any light on this?

Cheers,

Alan

**Aasheesh Pittie**

**From:** Edward Dickinson [asiaorn@tiscali.co.uk]  
**Sent:** 11 April, 2005 02:45 PM  
**To:** Alan Peterson  
**Subject:** Re: Re: Treron pompdora chloropterus Blyth date? H&M p.172; Peters III:16 HBW 5:195

Dear Alan,

I have not seen the India Sporting Review. I suggest that you ask Aasheesh if he can obtain a photocopy.

I shall be interested to see this too; what is "full ref."? Presumably this implies that Blyth's paper is cited and was in press at the JASB and that the ISR slipped out first. If so this implies that the "B" can be confidently identified with Blyth.

There are some who would argue that the description in here, judging by what you give, is an insufficient one but we know that Bonaparte in the Conspectus used some that were just as short. Others would argue that it is indeterminate. I wonder if Peters was aware of and considered such ideas. It does seem quite extraordinary that Peters did not draw heavily on the Richmond cardex; was there once perhaps a policy of trying to restrict it to those who visited the USNM?

From my point of view this is another case where H&M *cannot* use this unless someone publishes a short note 'correcting' general usage. The list of these is still fairly short only because I refer solely to cases where the year of publication differs. The list becomes quite long if it is a matter of correcting a citation while retaining the year.

So when you ask "am I missing something" I suppose I should respond, at some risk to life and limb, by saying that you are lacking, but perhaps not missing evidence of my lack of, enthusiasm in such cases.

yours aye

Edward

----- Original Message -----

**From:** Alan Peterson  
**To:** [Edward Dickinson](mailto:Edward.Dickinson)  
**Sent:** Sunday, April 10, 2005 5:25 PM  
**Subject:** [Norton AntiSpam] Re: Treron pompdora chloropterus Blyth date? H&M p.172; Peters III:16 HBW 5:195

Dear Edward,

There is no question that it appeared in 1846 JASB dated May 22, 1846.

It would appear the priority requirement necessitates citing it to Ind.SportingRev. for September of the previous year.

Am I missing something?

Alan

Edward Dickinson wrote:

Dear Alan,

This appears in Blyth, E., 1846. Drafts for a Fauna Indica (comprising the Animals of the

12-Apr-05

Himalaya Mountains, those of the Valley of the Indus, of the Provinces of Assam, Sylhet, Tipperah, Arracan, and of Ceylon, with Occasional Notices of Species from the Neighbouring Countries. J. Asiatic Soc. Bengal XIV (Part II No 168 New Series 84) (December): 845-878 (1845).

There is a postscript which carries the date May 22, 1846.

yours aye,

Edward

----- Original Message -----

**From:** Alan Peterson

**To:** Edward Dickinson

**Sent:** Sunday, April 10, 2005 3:24 PM

**Subject:** Treron pompdora chloropterus Blyth date? H&M p.172; Peters III:16 HBW 5:195

Edward,

*Treron chloroptera* Blyth.

Peters III:16 cites to J.A.S.B. 14, 1840 p.852 -- the 1840 must be a lapsus for 1845 or 1846, as it makes no sense for vol. 14.

H&M p.172 puts the date (more reasonably) at 1846 -- based, I presume, on the J.A.S.B. source.

HBW 5:195 uses 1846 and points to J.A.S.B. 14:852.

CWR, indeed has a J.A.S.B. card for Tr[eron] chloroptera J.A.S.B. XIV, pt.II, no.168; n.s. no.84, Dec, 1845, 852, in text and a note "Blyth's paper is Dated May 22, 1846" -- dating the taxon to 1846.

HOWEVER!!!! Prior to that he has a card as follows. (quotes " " are Richmond's)

~~~~~  
*Treron chroloptera* "B"  
 India Sporting Review, II, no.3, Sept., 1845, 28 (in text).

" A fifth Hurryaul, [APP: not completely sure of this word, possibly Hurryanl? ] of superior dimensions, but otherwise much resembling the pompadora, has lately been received by the Museum of the Asiatic Society from the Nicobar Islands, and is named by the Curator - Treron chloroptera." (full ref.)

(Book in Dept. Agr. library).

~~~~~  
 I checked for India Sporting Rev. in the Smithsonian Library Cat. ---- not there.

It seems to me that 1845 and the Ind.Sp.Rev. would appear to be the citation, non? My memory suggests Blyth was the curator, and would (obviously) be "B"?

Cheers,

Alan

12-Apr-05

# 7508

7/18/2005  
 7/18/2005  
 7/18/2005  
 7/18/2005  
 7/18/2005