

STATE

EXPRESS

TELEGRAM

SUBRAHMANYAN

CARE

FEDERATION

VIJAYAPURAM THWVJAVUR

REFUTEL SIXTEENTH JUNE 1971 STOP  
YOU HAVE BEEN MADE ONE OF THE  
DEFENDANTS IN THE ROYALTY CASE BY  
AN ORDER OF THE COURT STOP YOU  
MAY LIKE TO DEFEND THE SUIT AT  
MYSORE AT YOUR COST BY ENGAGING  
AN ADVOCATE

MALHOTRA  
CONSEARCH

N.T.T.

SA! ✓  
( C. L. Malhotra )  
Special Officer (Courts).

COUNCIL OF SCIENTIFIC & INDUSTRIAL RESEARCH

No.8/16/69-Vig.

Dated: June 29, 1971.

Copy by post in confirmation to :-

Shri V. Subrahmanyam,  
Emeritus Scientist,  
Research & Development Laboratory,  
Modern Rice Mill,  
Vijayapurama P.O.,  
Tiruvarur (S.Rly),  
Tamil Nadu.

He has been made one of the defendants  
in the case filed by Shri M.R. Ghandrasekhar against  
CSIR by an order of the Court. He may like to defend  
the case at his own cost. It is, however, expected  
that his entry into the defence may help the ~~XXXX~~  
court in arriving at correct decision in the case.

C. L. Malhotra  
( C. L. Malhotra )  
Special Officer (Courts).

Research and Development Laboratory,  
Modern Rice Mill,  
Vijayapuram P.O.,  
Tiruvavarur (S.Ry),  
Tamil Nadu,  
28/1/72.

The Special Officer (Courts),  
Council of Scientific and Industrial Research,  
Rafi Marg,  
NEW DELHI - 1.

Attention : Shri C.L. Malhotra.

Dear Sir,

Sub :- O.S. No.74 of 1969 before the Principal  
Civil Judge, Mysore - Case filed by Shri  
M.R. Chandrasekhara in the above court  
against the Vice-President's order of  
30/4/1969.

With reference to the above, I enclose herewith a copy of my letter dated 17/1/72 which I had addressed to the lawyer who is representing me in the above case.

The statement with the factual background which I submitted to the Court has placed the plaintiff and some of the others (who are also included as defendants) in a position of defence and they have made further statements which can be easily disproved with the materials now available with the Council.

The most important point which the Council, through its lawyer, will have to bring out is that Dr. Parpia was not a member of the staff of the Institute when the scientific studies, pilot trials and experiments with children in different institutions were carried out. He was not also concerned with the

negotiations with the Kaira Cooperative Union which were carried out by Prof. Thacker and myself. Dr. Kurien and his staff were responsible for the production and Messrs Voltas were responsible for the marketing of the product.

I do not know whether the related papers are still on the files of the Institute. There are, however, the technical reports and other papers submitted from time to time to the Executive Council of the Institute. There may be available with the Council and may still be referred to. The Institute may also have such reports starting from the early fifties when the work was started. Dr. Parpia joined the Institute as an Assistant Director only after the work was completed.

The process was perhaps the most successful one sponsored by the Council and the NRDC. The present annual royalty of about Rs.3 and odd lakhs is only a token as compared with the enormous turn-over and the different subsidiary industries which the production of baby food led to and which may now account for about Rs.100 crores per annum from several producers in the country.

An equitable decision in respect of the case will have a profound bearing on the advancement of applied research in which the council is keenly interested. I have already repeated<sup>ly</sup> drawn attention to the ethical aspects which are very important.

Notwithstanding the type of treatment which I had received from my successor, I do not bear any ill-will towards him. My immediate interest is only to get an early decision which, I trust, will vindicate the actions taken by the Council and myself. If I had erred in any direction it was in that of

having been over-generous and included the name of Dr. Parpia for any benefit. I did not even dream that the plaintiff would go back on his own signed statement which included all the factual information to show that Dr. Parpia had no claim to any share of the royalty. Anyway it is a thing of the part and I have only to think only of whatever little of the future which is left to me.

I would thank you therefore to kindly see that the necessary steps are taken to ensure that there is an early adjudication. It may be in the interests of some of the people and also of some of the lawyers to have the case prolonged, so that we may get tired and even seek a compromise. I am interested in an early court decision and I trust that the council will also take the necessary steps about it. The case has already dragged on for over 2½ years and there is no justification for any further delay.

Thanking you for necessary action and early advice,

Yours faithfully,

(Dr. V. SUBRAHMANYAN)

Emeritus Scientist

and

formerly, Director, C.F.T.R.I., Mysore.

having been over-generous and included the name of Dr. Parpia for any benefit. I did not even dream that the plaintiff would go back on his own signed statement which included all the factual information to show that Dr. Parpia had no claim to any share of the royalty. Anyway it is a thing of the part and I have only to think only of whatever little of the future which is left to me.

I would thank you therefore to kindly see that the necessary steps are taken to ensure that there is an early adjudication. It may be in the interests of some of the people and also of some of the lawyers to have the case prolonged, so that we may get tired and even seek a compromise. I am interested in an early court decision and I trust that the council will also take the necessary steps about it. The case has already dragged on for over 2½ years and there is no justification for any further delay.

Thanking you for necessary action and early advice,

Yours faithfully,

(Dr. V. SUBRAHMANYAN)

Emeritus Scientist

and

formerly, Director, C.F.T.R.I., Mysore.

Research and Development Laboratory,  
Modern Rice Mill,  
Vijayapuram P.O.,  
Tiruvannamalai (S.R.),  
Tamil Nadu  
28/12/72

The Special Officer (Courts),  
Council of Scientific and Industrial Research,  
Rafi Marg,  
New Delhi - 1

5 Copies

Attention: Shri C. L. Mahotra

Dear Sir -

Subject: O.S. No. 74 of 1969 before the  
Principal Civil Judge, Mysore - Case filed  
by Shri M. R. Phandrasekhara in the above Court  
against the Vice-President's order of 30/4/1969

With reference to the above, I enclose herewith a copy of my letter  
dt. 17/12/72 which I had addressed to the lawyer who is representing  
me in the above case.

The statement ~~was~~ with the factual background which I  
submitted to the Court has placed the plaintiff and some of the others  
(who are also included as defendants) in a position of defence and they have made  
further statements which can be easily disproved with the materials now  
available with the Council.

The most important point which the Council, through its  
lawyer, will have to bring out is that Dr Parke was not a member  
of the staff of the Institute when the scientific studies, pilot trials and  
experiments with children in different institutions were carried out. He was not  
also concerned with the negotiations with the Kaira Cooperative Union  
which were carried out by ~~me with the advice and assist~~ and Prof. Thacker  
and myself. Dr Kurien and his staff were responsible for the production and sales of vitamins  
were ~~responsible~~ for the marketing of the product.  
I do not know whether the related papers are still on the files  
of the Institute. There are, however, the ~~annual~~ <sup>Executive</sup> reports technical reports  
and other papers submitted from time to time to the Council of the  
Institute. There may be available with the Council and may still be  
referred to. The Institute may also have such reports starting from  
the early fifties when the work was started. Dr Parke joined the  
Institute as an Assistant Director only after the ~~scientific~~ work was  
completed.

The process was ~~one of~~ perhaps the most successful one sponsored by the Council  
and the N.R.D.C. The present annual royalty of about Rs 3 and odd lakhs  
is only a token as compared with the enormous turn-over and the different  
subsidiary industries which the production of baby food led to and which  
may now account for about Rs 100 crores per annum. ~~That of the case~~

An equitable decision in respect of the case will have a  
profound bearing on the advancement of applied research in which the  
Council is keenly interested. I have already repeatedly drawn attention to  
the ethical aspects which are <sup>very</sup> important.

from several producers in the country.

type of  
[Notwithstanding the] ~~study~~ treatment which I had received from my predecessor,  
I do not bear ~~it~~ any ill-will towards him. My immediate interest  
is only to get an early decision which, I trust, will ~~vindicate~~ <sup>justify</sup> the  
actions taken by the Council and myself.

I would thank you therefore to kindly see that ~~these~~  
the necessary steps are taken to ensure that there is <sup>an</sup> early adjudication.  
It may be in the interests of some of the people and also of some of the  
lawyers to have the case prolonged, so that ~~there may be~~ we may get  
tried and even seek a compromise. I am interested in an early Court  
decision as I trust that the Council will also take the necessary steps  
about it. The case has already dragged on for over 2½ years and there  
is no justification for any further delay.

Thanking you for necessary action and <sup>early</sup> advice,

Yours faithfully

(Dr. V. SUBRAMANIAM)

Emeritus Scientist

and

formerly, Director, C.F.T.R., Mysore.

If I had erred in any direction it was in that of having ~~been~~  
~~over-generous~~ ~~wishes~~ been over-generous and included the name of  
Dr Parpia for any benefit. I did not even dream that the plaintiff would  
~~will~~ go back on his own ~~signed~~ <sup>signed</sup> statement which includes all the factual  
information to show that Dr Parpia had no claim to any share of the royalty.  
Anyway, <sup>it</sup> is a thing of the past and I have only to think only of whatever  
little ~~the~~ of the future which is left to me.